Investigating Inter-Individual Differences in Human Brightness Perception

Bachelor Thesis

Anas al-Laham, 11.07.2022



Defined as perceived luminance

Highly dependent on visual context











White's effect (1979)





Simultaneous brightness induction







Motivation

Brightness varies between humans





Todorović illusion (1997)



Motivation

- Brightness varies between humans
- Often assessed using a small number of stimuli and participants
- ✤ We need to:

 - identify stimuli that produce least and most consistent effects

 - attain comprehensive dataset to test computational models

- produce data on a *large* number of stimuli depicting various context effects - attempt to generalize observed direction of effect to broader population





Research Question

- Explorative approach

Research question: To what extent do human observers differ or concur in their judgments of the perceived direction of selected brightness effects? Does their inter-individual variability correlate with the choice of stimuli?





Experimental Design





Stimuli

Total of 45 stimuli from three papers:- Robinson 2007

- Domijan 2015
- Murray 2020
- Each stimulus repeated 5 times
- Order that miminizes carryover effects





Task

5-item Likert scale: ordinal data no correct/incorrect answers



Which target is brighter?



Procedure

✤ 15 observers are to: - complete practice: 5 trials with "dummy" stimuli \rightarrow also used in actual experiment as catch trials - indicate choices on Likert scale

- Duration of about one hour per subject assuming • 15-second trials
- ✤ 3375 trials in total



Practice stimulus







Analysis

- variability correlate with the choice of stimuli?
- Approach:
 - take median of 5 observations as "final answer"
 - visualize data for all stimuli
 - calculate Krippendorff's alpha to estimate inter-individual agreement
- → data will be qualitatively described

Research question: To what extent do human observers differ or concur in their judgments of the perceived direction of selected brightness effects? Does their inter-individual

Also interesting: Intra-individual consistency and its relationship with our stimuli







Analysis - Krippendorff's alpha

- value ranges from 0 (perfect disagreement) to 1 (perfect agreement)
- $\alpha \ge 0.800$ indicates high reliability
- 0.800 > $\alpha \ge$ 0.667 indicates tentative reliability
- 0.667 > α indicates low reliability
- Why Krippendorff's α ?
 - applicable to ordinal data
 - not restricted in use to only two observers
 - takes disagreement magnitude into consideration
 - flexibility with missing data

Measure for inter-individual reliability: degree of agreement between observers



Fictitious, raw data of 10 participants and 20 stimuli.

	S1	S2	S3	S4	S5	S6	S7	S8	S9	S10	S11	S12	S13	S14	S15	S16	S17	S18	S19	S20
P1	4	4	2	2	4	2	3	5	3	4	2	5	2	1	4	4	2	1	5	2
P2	2	2	4	4	4	2	2	2	4	4	2	4	2	2	3	2	2	4	5	2
P3	4	5	4	1	4	2	2	4	4	3	2	2	2	1	2	4	4	2	5	4
P4	3	4	2	4	4	2	2	2	4	3	2	4	4	3	3	4	2	4	5	1
P5	4	4	3	2	4	3	4	5	4	3	1	5	3	2	4	2	2	3	4	2
P6	4	5	2	3	5	1	3	4	3	3	1	2	4	4	5	4	1	4	5	4
P7	5	5	5	2	4	3	2	4	4	2	2	4	4	2	4	2	2	4	4	5
P8	4	4	3	1	5	3	2	4	2	2	1	4	4	2	4	1	2	5	5	3
P9	1	3	5	2	4	4	3	1	4	4	2	3	1	4	3	4	3	3	4	1
P10	3	3	5	2	4	2	4	4	3	4	1	5	4	2	1	2	2	4	5	2





Left target is definitely brighter
 Left target is maybe brighter
 Targets are equally bright
 Right target is maybe brighter
 Right target is definitely brighter





Left target is definitely brighter Left target is maybe brighter Targets are equally bright Right target is maybe brighter Right target is definitely brighter

18





- Right target is definitely brighter

- Right target is maybe brighter
- Targets are equally bright
- Left target is maybe brighter
- Left target is definitely brighter







- Right target is definitely brighter

- Right target is maybe brighter
- Targets are equally bright
- Left target is maybe brighter

- Left target is definitely brighter

Krippendorff's $\alpha \approx 0.304$



Sources

Krippendorff, K. (2004). Reliability in content analysis: Some common 30(3), 411-433.

misconceptions and recommendations. Human communication research,



Questions?

